

people place heritage

CONTEXT

PRESTON MARKET HERITAGE STUDY

VOLUME 2: Significance

December 2017

Prepared for
City of Darebin



Cover image: Preston Market c. 1970s ('Preston Market with People Located in a Courtyard Surrounded by Shops 1970', Laurie Richards Studio (photographer) from <http://trove.nla.gov.au/work/221822817?q=preston+market&c=picture&versionId=243284814>)

© Context 2017

[GML Heritage Victoria Pty Ltd, trading as Context. ABN 31 620 754 761]

Project Team:

Chris Johnston, Project Manager

Emma Russell

Vicki McLean

Jessica Antolino

Chairim Byun

Donna Fearne

Report Register

This report register documents the development and issue of the report entitled *Preston Market Heritage Study - Volume 2 Significance* undertaken by Context in accordance with our internal quality management system.

| Project No. | Issue No. | Notes/description | Issue Date | Issued to |
|-------------|-----------|--|------------|-------------|
| 2223 | 1 | Draft Report | 20.11.2017 | Peter Mondy |
| 2223 | 2 | Draft Final Report (word version with tracked changes) | 28.11.2017 | Peter Mondy |
| 2223 | 2 | Final Report | 21.12.2017 | Peter Mondy |

Context

22 Merri Street, Brunswick VIC 3056

Phone 03 9380 6933

Facsimile 03 9380 4066

Email context@contextpl.com.au

Web www.contextpl.com.au

CONTENTS

| | |
|--|-----------|
| LIST OF FIGURES | IV |
| LIST OF TABLES | IV |
| EXECUTIVE SUMMARY | V |
| Introduction | v |
| Assessment | v |
| Key findings and recommendations | vi |
| 1 INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| 1.1 Background | 1 |
| 1.2 Purpose | 1 |
| 1.3 Methodology | 2 |
| 1.5 Terminology | 2 |
| 1.6 Acknowledgements | 2 |
| 2 ASSESSMENT | 3 |
| 5.1 Assessment against criteria | 3 |
| 5.2 Comparative analysis | 7 |
| 5.3 Relative significance | 12 |
| 5.4 Statement of significance | 12 |
| 3 KEY FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS | 15 |
| 6.1 Significance of Preston Market | 15 |
| 6.2 Respecting connections and meanings | 18 |
| 6.3 Interpretation: sharing the stories and significance of Preston Market | 20 |
| 6.4 Further research into potential State significance | 20 |
| REFERENCES | 22 |
| APPENDIX 1 – CRITERIA FOR ASSESSING CULTURAL SIGNIFICANCE | 24 |
| APPENDIX 2: INDICATORS OF SOCIAL VALUE | 25 |

LIST OF FIGURES

| | |
|---|----|
| Figure 1. Aerial image of market with areas of relative significance marked. The yellow line represents an 8.75m curtilage around the market buildings. | 16 |
|---|----|

LIST OF TABLES

| | |
|---|----|
| Table 1. Primary themes relevant to Preston Market | 10 |
| Table 2. Criteria for which Preston Market reaches the threshold for local significance | 12 |
| Table 3. Intactness of Preston Market buildings | 14 |
| Table 4: Significant elements | 17 |
| Table 5: Recommended controls | 17 |

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Introduction

In July 2017, the City of Darebin commissioned Context to provide a heritage assessment of the Preston Market, with a particular emphasis on historical and social values. This study would build on a preliminary study completed in 2011 as part of a project on Victoria's post 1940s migration heritage (Context 2011).

To be prepared in two stages, the heritage study required research into the history of Preston Market, its design, form and layout and its social and community uses and associations (Stage 1). Stage 2 (this Volume) provides an assessment of the market's heritage values (Section 2) in accordance with and the requirements of the *Planning Practice Note 1: Applying the Heritage Overlay* (DELWP 2015) and the *Australia ICOMOS Charter for Places of Cultural Significance 2013* (The Burra Charter and associated Practice Notes) (Stage 2). Key findings and recommendation are contained in Section 3.

Assessment

Heritage values are assessed using the eight criteria contained in the *Planning Practice Note 1: Applying the Heritage Overlay* (DELWP 2015) and included in Appendix 1. These criteria are designed to help describe the nature of the heritage significance of the place. The thresholds to be applied in the assessment of significance are 'State Significance' and 'Local Significance'; 'Local Significance' includes those places that are important to a particular community or locality.

Section 2.1 presents an analysis of the significance of Preston Market, drawing on the research in the earlier sections of the report. Then Section 2.2 presents a comparative analysis, first based on two place types: community meeting or gathering places in Preston, and then in relation to other markets. It then considers Preston Market in relation to historical themes using *Victoria's Framework of Historical Themes* (Heritage Council of Victoria 2009) and the *Darebin Heritage Study – Volume 1 Thematic Environmental History* (Context Pty Ltd 2007). Finally, this section considers design, layout and architectural innovation.

The analysis concludes that Preston Market is of local significance (2.3) in relation to five of the eight criteria (A, D, E, F, G).

The Statement of Significance presented in Section 2.4 addresses:

- **What is significant?** – that is, which elements of the place contribute to the identified heritage significance
- **How is it significant?** – this refers to the nature of significance, described in a sentence
- **Why is it significant?** – this section elaborates the reasons why the place is significant, cross-referenced to the relevant criteria.

To provide further guidance to the City of Darebin, Section 2.4 also lists the attributes that 'hold' or embody or express a particular aspect of significance. At Preston market there is a strong relationship between the physical or tangible form of the market and its intangible attributes. Intangible attributes are those that relate to cultural practices, knowledge, traditions, performance, beliefs and world views etc.

Key findings and recommendations

Section 3 reflects the finding that Preston Market is of local heritage significance, and recommends that:

1. The City of Darebin includes Preston Market in the Heritage Overlay of the Darebin Planning Scheme based on the Statement of significance, defined extent and draft Schedule in this report.

Preston Market - Significance of Elements



- Area recommended for curtilage (8.75m around market boundary)
- Built fabric - Significant
- Walkways - Significant
- Built fabric - Not Significant



2. The City of Darebin, in consultation with Market management and property owners, review the Preston Market Incorporated Plan (2007) and address a number of matters relevant to the statement of significance, good heritage management, and both the tangible and intangible attributes of the Market, including:

- o achieving high quality pedestrian amenity through consideration of building scale, microclimate issues and access.
- o integration of the public realm with the Market
- o limiting large scale development within specified distances of the Market footprint.

The above objectives are consistent with the Market's social value and the importance of retaining certain attributes including:

- o the wide cruciform pedestrian streets that offer a stage for activities or encounters
- o crossing places that sustain social engagement

-
- open edges that promote public access
 - natural light and a sense of being open to the outside ('open air market').
3. The City of Darebin considers the development of guidelines that sit underneath the Incorporated Plan to assist in managing different attribute of built form and spaces, and their tolerance for change. These guidelines could cover for example: maintenance, conservation and repair; demolition, alterations and additions; new development; signage; interpretation.
 4. In relation to respecting connections and meanings, and being cognisant of *Planning Practice Note 1: Applying the Heritage Overlay* (DELWP 2015) and the Burra Charter (Australia ICOMOS 2013), the City of Darebin with Market management and the property owners could establish a set of objectives or principles in the Incorporated Plan or in another form to:
 - recognise and express respect for community connections (associations) and meanings that are evident in activities, uses and cultural practice at the market
 - appreciate the important social role of the market in the life of the local and market communities and bring this into in future planning and design
 - establish a suitable process for community engagement when change is proposed, and
 - establish a process for heritage impact assessment in relation to changes that might impact community connections (associations) and meanings.

Further the City of Darebin should make this heritage study publicly available and prepare archival standard photography record.
 5. The City of Darebin initiates an interpretation strategy project, in consultation with Market management and the property owners. Specifically, it is recommended that the City of Darebin supports:
 - publication of a brief social history of the Preston Market in an accessible format (hard copy, e-book)
 - a community-based activity or activities to document community perceptions of the market and market life/culture: this could be through an arts, history or culture-focused project
 - on-site interpretation of the stories of the Preston Market (via story-boards, QR codes or a place-based app)
 - links the stories of the market to the wider stories of the immediate locality.
 6. The City of Darebin considers whether it wishes to undertake further research to determine whether two aspects of the Preston market may be of State significance: the use of space-frame technology, given its early use at Preston Market and the importance of the market to represent a key aspect of post-war migration history.

1 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

The City of Darebin commissioned Context in July 2017 to provide a heritage study of the Preston Market, addressing all the potential heritage values that may be associated with the Preston Market and giving a particular emphasis to historical and social values.

The heritage study would build on a preliminary study completed in 2011 as part of a project on Victoria's post 1940s migration heritage (Context 2011). The 2011 project included case studies within the City of Darebin which aimed to test out different ways of working with migrant communities to identify places associated with post 1940s migration and understand their heritage values. There were five case studies within City of Darebin. Context worked with Way Back When and The Connies, Council and Library officers and the Ethnic Communities Council. One case study focused on Preston Market and included preliminary historical research, 24 interviews, 12 with stallholders and 12 with shoppers, and a brief assessment of the heritage values of the market.

1.2 Purpose

The purpose of Stage 2 of the Preston Market heritage study was to assess the cultural heritage significance of the Preston Market. The assessment followed Stage 1 of the project which examined the history of the Preston Market, its design, form and layout, and its social and community functions.

The cultural heritage significance assessment was undertaken in accordance with the principles and procedures set out in the *Australia ICOMOS Charter for Places of Cultural Significance 2013* (the Burra Charter) and the associated Practice Notes, and also with regard to the *Planning Practice Note 1: Applying the Heritage Overlay*.¹

The heritage values used in the Stage 2 assessment are historic, scientific, aesthetic, social and spiritual values (as articulated in the Burra Charter). Specifically, the assessment used the criteria in Appendix 1 and applied the thresholds of local significance and state significance. In doing this, some comparative assessment was undertaken to understand the design precedents for the form and layout of the market, and to consider it in relation to other local/regional fresh food markets in Melbourne.

In their brief, the City of Darebin emphasised the importance of understanding the social history of the market and considering it as a place situated in a particular context and time period, and as a social artefact, potentially having heritage values expressed in the physical fabric of the place (tangible attributes) and in cultural practices, uses and activities (intangible attributes).

The report concludes with recommendations to the City of Darebin, suggesting some actions that could be considered to protect and interpret the heritage values of Preston Market. Market, and how they contribute to policy in relation to the Market.

¹ Department of Environment, Land, Water and Planning 2015, *Planning Practice Note 1: Applying the Heritage Overlay*.

1.3 Methodology

The key elements of the project methodology for Stage 2 of the Preston Market heritage study are described below.

Assessment of significance

The historical, physical and community associations material assembled in Stage 1 of the Preston Market heritage study was analysed in relation to the heritage criteria (Section 2.1, Appendix 1) and from that analysis, a statement of significance was prepared using the format recommended by the Victorian Heritage Council (Section 2.4) along with the attributes that embody or demonstrate each aspect of significance.

Appendix 2 includes further details on the assessment of social significance (Criterion G).

Key Findings and Recommendations

The Preston Market statement of significance (Section 2.4) and analysed historical, physical and community associations material was the basis for developing the key findings (Section 3.1) and recommendations outlined in Section 3. The recommendations specifically relate to Respecting connections and meaning (Section 3.2), Interpretation sharing the stories and significance of Preston Market (Section 3.3) and Further research into the potential state significance of the Preston Market (Section 3.4).

1.4 Terminology

The terminology used in this project follows the conventions of the Australia ICOMOS Burra Charter, the criteria and the Heritage Council of Victoria's *The Victorian Heritage Register Criteria and Threshold Guidelines: Assessing the cultural heritage significance of places and objects for possible state heritage listing* (updated 2014).²

1.5 Acknowledgements

The assistance of Paul Michell (historian and former local history librarian, City of Darebin) is gratefully acknowledged. Paul assisted with access to a range of historical source materials.

² Australia ICOMOS Burra Charter, 2013; Heritage Council of Victoria 2014, *The Victorian Heritage Register Criteria and Threshold Guidelines: Assessing the cultural heritage significance of places and objects for possible state heritage listing*

2 ASSESSMENT

2.1 Assessment against criteria

This section brings together all the evidence gathered to provide an assessment of Preston Market's cultural or heritage significance (using the criteria in Appendix 1) and a comparative analysis in relation to other similar places. It finishes with a Statement of Significance that defines 'What', 'How' and 'Why' Preston Market is significant.

For assessment purposes, the threshold level of significance is defined as local. The research indicates Preston Market is of:

- historical significance within the City of Darebin (Criterion A)
- a representative example of post-war market type (Criterion D)
- aesthetic, architectural and technological significance (Criterion E and F) also to the City of Darebin, but possibly more broadly, and
- social significance to the identified associated communities (Criterion G).

Historical significance

Criterion A: Importance to the course, or pattern, of the City of Darebin's cultural history.

The history of the Preston Market site reflects the development of Preston from Wurundjeri-willam traditional Country to farming and market gardening, sheep grazing and later to its use for industry. There is no evidence remaining of these earlier periods except for remnant street patterns.

The size of the area occupied by the Broadhurst tannery up until 1960, close to what had started to develop as the commercial and civic heart of Preston from the 1920s, provided an ideal opportunity for a large-scale market to be developed to support the growing population of Preston. As a consequence, the development of Preston Market worked to reinforce the centrality of this location as both a commercial, civic and community precinct. The wider precinct, including Preston Market, is significant for its ability to demonstrate a series of important historical phases within the City of Darebin that have shaped today's community.

[Themes: 2.2 Migration; 4.6 Retailing, hospitality and entertainment – subtheme Preston]

After World War Two, the social, cultural and demographic landscape of Preston changed dramatically as post-war European migrants from Greece, Macedonia and Italy arrived, many thousands being accommodated in Nissen huts as temporary homes on what was to become the site of Northland shopping centre; a new model of shopping and a rival to Preston Market.

Although the size of the site and its accessibility was a factor in the decision to establish Preston Market on the present site, so was the recognition that the post-war migrants were seeking to buy foods 'from home'; they may have also actively sought out traditional market shopping modes. Preston Market is important in demonstrating the dramatic changes in food, cuisine and cultural diversity that resulted from post-war migration; it is a particularly good example within the City of Darebin as it demonstrates the continuous nature of this process of migrant-related social change that continues today.

The development of the Preston Market in the form of a traditional market, with independently owned stalls, appears to have been prompted by or in response to the cultural shift in shopping being presented by the new north American model of enclosed and air-conditioned shopping centre that was first seen at Chadstone in 1960, and followed soon after by Northland in 1966. Removed from the local bustle of the street and standing apart as something 'modern' – this new form of shopping centre was designed to offer an experience of contemporary sophistication to weekly shopping. Deciding to establish a new 'traditional' market – the first such 'traditional' market to open in Melbourne for over fifty years - and in

almost direct competition to this new shopping centre just two blocks away it was a bold decision. Preston Market and Northland, as two distinct places within the City of Darebin, together provide evidence of the influence of the new North American model of shopping in enclosed shopping malls and of a counter-thrust in the development of a contemporary market-style of retailing designed to attract the newly-settled migrants as traders and customers.

[Themes: migrating and making a home; marketing and retailing; working; shaping the suburbs; peopling Darebin; developing Darebin's economies]

In the decades that followed Preston continued to be an attraction to migrants from other parts of the world: China and Vietnam, India and Sri Lanka and, in more recent years, from the Middle East. Every one of these and other cultures is represented at the Market through the stallholders, the food, and the shoppers. The Preston Market is important in demonstrating the cultural adaptability, diversity and inclusion that has been a strong pattern in the development of the City of Darebin since the end of World War Two. At a local level the Market is an excellent example of the cultural and social outcomes of migration.

[Themes: migrating and making a home; marketing and retailing; working; shaping the suburbs; peopling Darebin; developing Darebin's economies]

Preston Market demonstrates, at the local level, the influence of post-war migration on the cultural and social life of Victorian communities in the latter half of the twentieth century. The development of Preston Market demonstrates the influence of post-war migration on food culture, with migrants establishing small independent businesses at Preston Market (and presumably at Melbourne's other markets) which were strongly supported by fellow migrants keen to purchase familiar foods that were difficult to obtain or unavailable elsewhere and to retain aspects of their traditional cuisines.

Preston Market demonstrates, at the local level, the evolution in the shopping and eating habits of many different cultural groups, and the way people mix and socialise, or stay in touch with their families.

[Themes: pattern and changes in shopping practices and culture; maintaining distinctive cultures; preserving traditions and community].

Representative significance

Criterion D: Importance in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of cultural places and objects.

Preston Market is a representative example of the market typology. The market type has been around for centuries and across cultures. Typically, it is a utilitarian structure, often with an open air or semi-permanent section, and a strong connection to locality. Open or informal arrangements facilitate a lively and dynamic interaction between buyers and sellers. While the Preston Market exhibits characteristics of the typical market type, contemporary materials and technologies were used in its construction.

Development of the Preston Market in this way directly contrasts with development of other retail spaces at the time. In the late 1950s a new building type emerged in America and developed in the Australian suburbs in the late 1950s and 1960s. The regional shopping centre type was a direct response to the particular conditions of the post-World War 2 period including a rapid expansion of the suburbs, increased private car ownership, growing prosperity, and a rising interest in the 'modern' lifestyle.

Later examples of the type were larger in scale and more glamorous in style. Deliberately designed to turn away from existing local facilities, they were marketed as an alternative 'town centre' with a range of shops and services located within an enclosed commercial space. Examples in Melbourne include Northland in Preston (1966), Chadstone in Chadstone (1960), Eastland in Ringwood (1967), and Southland in Cheltenham (1968).

By contrast, the Preston Market was developed with a strong connection to its locality. A primary east west axis links Preston Station and the High Street shopping strip. A north-south

axis intersected the east-west access, and establishes a cruciform plan for the market layout. In line with town planning thinking at the time, cars were separated from pedestrian areas and the primary axes became 'pedestrian streets'. This original concept remains as a defining aspect of the market layout.

The wider civic, commercial and community precinct within which Preston Market is located demonstrates the application of new concepts in town and regional planning introduced in the Melbourne Metropolitan Planning Scheme 1954 by the then metropolitan planning authority, the Melbourne and Metropolitan Board of Works. This area was chosen because of the good public transport access, the size of the land, and the significance and extent of the commercial and civic interests in the immediate neighbourhood.

The precinct was one of only five District Business Centres intended to regulate and decentralise major activities away from the centre of Melbourne. These District Business Centres were designated as preferred locations for markets, and at Preston this aspiration was achieved. It is possible that the precinct, including Preston Market, has the ability to demonstrate the characteristics of a District Business Centre created through the application of town planning principles promulgated in the 1950s. Further research and comparative analysis would be required in relation to the Preston District Business Centres and the other 5 equivalents.

Aesthetic significance

Criterion E: Importance in exhibiting particular aesthetic characteristics.

Designed by the company Structural Consortium, a group of university graduates who embraced new concepts in architectural thought, the building has a strong industrial aesthetic which reflects the industrial character of the suburb. This would have contrasted with the more glamorous and fashionable aesthetic typical of the regional shopping centre type (such as nearby Northland). At the Preston Market, primary aesthetic interest is derived from the rhythm of structural components, and in particular, from the repetition of the delicate weblike structure of the space frame steel trusses down the length of each building.

Creative or technical significance

Criterion F: Importance in demonstrating a high degree of creative or technical achievement at a particular period.

The Preston Market was the site of the first application of space frame technology in Victoria. Space frames are three-dimensional steel truss-like structures, built of interlocking struts arranged in a triangulated pattern. The technology provides a strong but light weight rigid structure able to span large distances with minimal interior supports, and that can easily be extended or adapted.

The design of the Preston Market reflected contemporary architectural ideas of the era which espoused flexibility and adaptability in buildings as a means of adjusting to what was perceived as an ever-changing society. The use of prefabricated components such as tilt up concrete wall panels and space frame trusses were seen as a means of ensuring the building could be adapted to meet changing needs or functions as required, in contrast to more traditional forms of construction that responded to prescribed or finite functions or uses.

Social significance

Criterion G: Strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group for social, cultural or spiritual reasons. This includes the significance of a place to Indigenous peoples as part of their continuing and developing cultural traditions.

The strong and special association of particular communities with Preston Market is demonstrated against the key social value indicators below.

Important to a community as a landmark, marker or signature

Preston Market is an important social and cultural landmark within Preston and the inner northern suburbs. Seen in some ways as a local ‘secret’, a place that is only known to ‘insiders’, Preston Market is closely identified with the locality and its communities of shoppers and stallholders. In turn, Preston Market offers a tangible expression of the cultural diversity of this locality. Preston Market is at least one of the physical and cultural ‘hearts of the north’.

Preston Market signifies the history of this locality and the creation of its cultural diversity in the post-war period, and has become a symbol of diversity and inclusion.

Preston Market figures in the daily life of the locality, connecting people together in social relationships that are highly valued and often long-standing. Through its design and layout, Preston Market has created spaces where people can engage with each other, formally and informally and as part of the economic exchange of shopping or alternatively through other activities and ways of meeting up. In this sense, the spaces have created opportunities for communities/social groups to form and be sustained and the presence of these diverse communities has and will continue to shape the cultural experience of the market.

Important as a reference point in a community's identity or sense of itself

Preston Market represents and sustains important community ideas about cultural diversity and inclusiveness that form a significant element in community identity across the City of Darebin and beyond. While on one reading Preston Market is simply a commercial space, for the community of shoppers and stallholders it is far more than this; it is a shared community space that people engage with culturally. Preston Market creates and sustains opportunities for cultural practices associated with food and cuisine to continue, for example. It also enables the sharing of cultural traditions.

Symbolically, Preston Market connects people to their own cultural past as well as to the collective story of post-war migration, a seminal event which dramatically reshaped this locality and its communities. And while the whole locality in some way expresses this momentous period of change (as do other Melbourne suburbs), Preston Market remains a place where the community can continue to experience the cultural transformation arising from migration.

Preston Market is a place where continuing traditions – in food, cuisine, and in the market-style of trading – are practiced and passed on. While there is a current revival in markets as evidenced by pop-up farmers markets, Preston Market represents a continuing tradition, across generations as is evident in the interviews with stallholders and shoppers.

For the stallholders at Preston Market – as a particular and closely connected community – the market is more than just a place of business. Their experience of the market is of being part of a community – a market community of stallholders and customers. These market-based relationships, along with the opportunity to express their own cultural identity and values through their business appear to be vitally important elements in their sense of identity.

Strong or special community attachment developed from use and/or association

The longevity of continuous use as a market has created strong and special bonds between stallholders and regular shoppers, and these are linked to the place itself, to the valued customary experience of market-style shopping, and to the interpersonal relationships sustained through the market.

Developed at a time when retailing was adopting the new ‘enclosed shopping centre’ model, the creation of Preston Market reflects a strong move counter to this trend. The concept was well supported from the start, and Preston Market has continued to serve as a ‘community place’ as well as a well-patronised shopping area.

Life and works of a person or group

Criterion H: Special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in Darebin's history.

The establishment of Preston Market is associated with a number of people particularly Leon and Lola Jolson. On the basis of the information considered in this heritage assessment, we are unable to conclude as to whether their contribution is significant to the City of Darebin under Criterion (H).

The Jolsons were involved in a number of development activities in Melbourne including Leonda by the Yarra developed in 1970 by Leon Jolson and David Walker. Prior to this Leon Jolson had worked at estate agencies including Blackburn and Lockwood until he established his own under the name of L. Jolson and Co in Malvern Road, Prahran which he ran for 25 years until he sold it to R.E. Passmore and Son. Leon also refurbished Earl's Court, which he later converted the venue into a popular ballroom at St Kilda.³

Our research did not reveal any specific connections with the City of Darebin other than the development of the market.

2.2 Comparative analysis

Introduction

Following the application of criteria in the assessment of significance, the second task of the assessment process is to establish the relative level of significance and the 'threshold'. Threshold decisions are supported by the comparative analysis of similar places. This enables a decision about whether one place is 'more' or 'less' significant than other similar places, and assists particularly in the application of criterion (d) which requires consideration of the principal characteristics of a class of cultural places and objects.

Establishing a valid basis for comparison enables a robust understanding of how important a place is and to whom. Useful tools for establishing comparative significance include thematic or typological studies, local or regional surveys or the comparison of other 'like' places represented on various heritage registers.

Markets are not a very large or broad class of place, and few are protected at a State or local level. The approach to the selection of comparative places is outlined in the method section below and a conclusion is provided at the end of this section.

Method

The basis for comparison was established as being markets most similar in function, location, layout and establishment period of Preston Market. These are markets that are:

- 'traditional', where the stalls are held by individual traders and run independent of each other
- 'permanent', where the market is held at a permanent built structure, as opposed to pop-up markets and
- 'retail', as opposed to wholesale markets.

The period in which a market was established was also seen as a relevant consideration. Comparable markets are those established during the twentieth-century, with a focus on interwar and post-war, a development period connected to emerging and growing suburbs such as Preston as it transformed from industrial to suburban. Such markets reflect an important historical, cultural and development phase in Victoria's history. Some earlier markets also offer comparable examples, especially where an earlier market site has been developed or moved during the twentieth century.

³ <http://www.propertyobserver.com.au/forward-planning/advice-and-hot-topics/title-tattle/35499-payneswicke-the-heritage-elsternwick-trophy-home-sold.html>

Desktop research was carried out to identify comparable markets across Melbourne. Searches included the *Victorian Heritage Database*, local council heritage databases, and general internet searches. The research showed that few markets, let alone those considered comparable, are listed on the Victorian Heritage Register or included in the Heritage Overlay in local planning schemes; those that have been recognised as heritage places to date are all established in the nineteenth century.

No additional comparable markets emerged from the research into community connections to Preston Market; other markets mentioned by those responding to the survey included ‘farmers’ markets’ in general and those specifically in Coburg, Eltham, Elwood, St Kilda and Whittlesea. These were not added to the analysis due to the temporary, ‘pop-up’ nature of these markets.

While markets may be seen as having a primarily commercial function, markets also function as informal meeting places for local communities. Markets are often located in the town centre or a highly visible or accessible location, and they usually provide places for people to sit, talk and eat. This is true around the world and reflects the importance of markets as a part of the social fabric of a community. The survey undertaken for this project and the analysis of the Preston Market case study interviews (Context 2011) revealed that Preston Market has an important social function as an informal meeting place, as well as cultural functions associated with traditional food and cuisine. On this basis, comparable meeting places within the City of Darebin were investigated, as well as markets exhibiting similar cultural functions to those of Preston Market.

Comparable places

Meeting places

Within the City of Darebin, there are several places that serve as community meeting places, including civic buildings, sporting facilities and community halls. Those protected in the Heritage Overlay of the Darebin Planning Scheme include:

- Preston Town Hall (HO50) & Northcote Town Hall (HO97): These are examples of meeting places within the municipality with strong social significance, as places that continue to provide a community focus for civic activity.⁴
- Preston City Oval (HO210): This space is significant as Darebin’s earliest recreational space, and as one of the municipality’s longest-standing sporting and social venues.⁵
- West Preston Progress Hall (HO212): Constructed in 1930, the Hall is associated with an important phase in the suburban development of West Preston (and Reservoir), and has direct and strong associations with the West Preston Progress Association, a resident group whose role was pivotal in the formation of the suburban community during the inter-war period.⁶

The Preston Market is one of few mercantile meeting places within the municipality, and stands alone when considering its specific commercial function as a traditional market. One comparable place is the former shops at 471-473 High Street, Preston (HO227). While this place is associated with the commercial development arising from Preston’s population growth following World War II, and demonstrates the significant development of the suburb in the decade following Preston’s proclamation as a city in 1926,⁷ the absence of strong community connection to this place and no evidence that it functioned as a community meeting place positions Preston Market as a better example.⁸ The Preston Market holds a range of strongly

⁴ Hermes record, Preston Town Hall, 76929, City of Darebin, accessed 1 November 2017.

⁵ Hermes record, Preston City Oval, 27068, City of Darebin, accessed 1 November 2017.

⁶ Hermes record, West Preston Progress Hall, 26608, City of Darebin, accessed 1 November 2017.

⁷ Hermes record, Shops (former), 27314, City of Darebin, accessed 1 November 2017.

⁸ Preston Market, in its form and layout, has deliberately created spaces where people can mingle, sit, engage; as is pointed out in Market Crossings (Stead 2010) Preston Market is socially permeable, and a person can be there without purchasing.

held community values for the two identified communities: stallholders and shoppers. The social research conducted as part of the heritage values assessment revealed many respondents' associations with the market as a place for the community to gather and 'a market for everyone', with a great appreciation of the market as a diverse community hub encompassing all classes and demographic groups.

Markets

Preston Market is the only traditional market within the City of Darebin, and there are few directly comparable markets in the wider region. Preston has had a string of markets established since the late nineteenth-century, from the former wholesale markets borne out of the area's early farming community, to the short lived, interwar retail markets established in the years prefacing and throughout the 1930s depression. However, when the present-day Preston Market was built in 1969, it offered a different shopping and community experience compared to the more glamorous and 'Modern' emerging regional shopping centre type, and created a traditional market within a contemporary architectural aesthetic, while also offering accessibility by public transport and car.

Nineteenth-century markets

Three of the four surviving retail markets established during the nineteenth-century – Queen Victoria (1878), South Melbourne (1867) and Prahran (1891) – are not directly comparable to Preston Market as they are reflective of a different era. These places, whilst planned and built to support a heavy influx of migration (like Preston Market) during the gold rush years, mirrored a time when markets provided the only source of revenue for the city administrators in the early years of settlement and the market commissioners were also the city's earliest administrators⁹. On the contrary, Preston Market and other like inter- and post-war markets demonstrate a shift in cultural shopping and mercantile practices, and in the case of Preston Market, being a privately funded initiative but built with the apparent support of the then City of Preston.¹⁰

An exception to this means of comparison is Dandenong Market (1866), which was relocated to its present site in 1926, and will be investigated in the following section.

Interwar & Post-war markets

There are no inter- or post-war markets represented in the Heritage Overlay of local planning schemes throughout Victoria, and few comparable places of this era within the City of Darebin. Those places of commercial activity that do exist are comparable because they reflect the course and pattern of Preston's history, and one such example is Northland Shopping Centre in Preston (1966). Northland was one of a new building type which emerged in North America in the 1950s and developed in Australia in the late 1950s and 60s, with Chadstone being the first in Melbourne in 1960 and Chermside in Brisbane three years before. This regional shopping centre type developed in direct response to the particular conditions of the post-World War 2 period; Northland played a role in addressing the rapid expansion of Preston and the wider municipality, increased private car ownership and a rising interest in the 'Modern' lifestyle.¹¹

Inter- or post-war markets that exist outside of the local municipality are comparable because they represent the development of shopping practice and culture at that time and offer a more traditional social experience in an outdoor or semi-outdoor setting compared to the enclosed

⁹ Martin, in Context 2015, p. 5.

¹⁰ Market Crossings (Stead 2010:18) notes that the construction of Northland was reluctantly agreed to by the Council and they 'kept pushing for shopping outlets to be built on the site where Broadhurst's tannery used to stand'.

¹¹ Today, Australia has more than 1300 enclosed shopping centres of this type: 'Dawn of the dead mall: will we follow the US and dump the shopping centre?', The Conversation, < <http://theconversation.com/dawn-of-the-dead-mall-will-we-follow-the-us-and-dump-the-shopping-centre-3507> > accessed 20 November 2017.

privatised spaces of the new shopping centre type. The following places were established, like Preston Market, in response to the inter- and post-war boom of the suburbs, and represent a shift in shopping practice and culture from the larger enclosed shopping centre facilities, back to the traditional market typology:

- Dandenong Market, Dandenong, City of Greater Dandenong: Originally opened in 1866, the market was relocated to its present site in 1926 due to overwhelming population growth of the town. The site served as a military training camp in World War Two.¹²
- Caribbean Gardens and Market, Scoresby, City of Knox: In the 1950s, the site was first used to operate a successful boat factory, and a lake was built to test the boats. The Gardens opened to the public in the 60s and more local people began visiting the park and lakeshore, bringing with them their second-hand goods to peddle out of their car boots. A permanent, traditional Market was officially opened to the public in 1976.¹³
- Bell Street Mall, Heidelberg West, City of Banyule: Built in 1956-57, the Mall was the first Housing Commission of Victoria (HCV) shopping centre to incorporate town planning theory regarding the separation of pedestrians from cars.¹⁴

In summary, the Preston Market compares well to the above examples and meets the local threshold for historical significance. It represents a time when migration and growth saw an increase in cultural diversity and inclusion in Preston, and reflects the development of shopping practices and culture during the inter- and post-war period.

Thematic comparisons

The Preston Market is associated with several themes in both *Victoria's Framework of Historical Themes* and the *Darebin Heritage Study – Volume 1 Thematic Environmental History*, as established in Volume 1 Preston Market Heritage Study - History and Community Connections (Section 2.5 Thematic context). It is useful to draw comparisons with other like places in relation to these themes to determine thresholds for historical significance.

Table 1. Primary themes relevant to Preston Market

| Victoria's Framework of Historical Themes | City of Darebin thematic environmental history |
|--|---|
| 2.5 Migrating and making a home 2.6 Maintaining distinctive cultures 5.3 Marketing and retailing 6.3 Shaping the suburbs 8.5 Preserving traditions and commemorating | 2.2 Migration – subtheme Post-Second World War immigrants 2.3 Promoting settlements – subtheme Housing Commission of Victoria (in relation to post-war migration) 4.6 Retailing, hospitality and entertainment – subtheme Preston and subtheme Northland 5.3 Developing the suburban ideal |

Preston Market is representative at a local scale of the way in which post-war migrants transformed Victoria into a society of richly diverse cultures (2. *Peopling Victoria's places and landscapes – 2.5 Migrating and making a home*). It contributes to Preston's distinctive multicultural character, unlike any other place within the City of Darebin (2. *Peopling Darebin – 2.2 Migration*). In this respect, Preston Market compares well to:

¹² 'Market History', 2015, <<http://dandenongmarket.com.au/about/history>>, accessed 1 November 2017.

¹³ 'Celebrating 50 years of history at Caribbean Gardens and Market!', 2016, <<http://caribbeangardens.com.au/>>, accessed 1 November 2017.

¹⁴ Context, 'Bell Street Mall Heritage Assessment & Guidelines', prepared for Banyule City Council, 2010, p. 2.

-
- Bell Street Mall (1956) in the nearby City of Banyule, for its role in supporting migrant communities housed in accommodation provided by the Housing Commission of Victoria
 - Dandenong Market (1926) on the south-eastern edge of Melbourne and within the once separate ‘town’ of Dandenong, as it displays similar cultural functions to that of Preston, associated with the international food and cuisine linked strongly to the cultures and homelands of both traders and customers.

In the survey, people were asked to select or name other markets they shopped or ran a stall at, and then to rate them as ‘better’ or ‘worse’ than the Preston Market with a reason. The most frequently mentioned markets were the Queen Victoria Market and the South Melbourne Market. Several of the values and connections noted by respondents in relation to these markets are similar to the strong values identified for Preston Market (refer to Volume 1 Preston Market Heritage Study - History and Community Connections, Section 4.6), namely the ‘community feel’ and atmosphere of the place; several respondents identified the need for each market to have its own “unique quality or vibe”.

Other comparable markets identified and known for their cultural diversity include the Dandenong Market (1866, relocated to its present site in 1926) and the Footscray Market (1929). These each serve distinct catchments within the Melbourne metropolitan area.

This study has investigated Preston Market thoroughly, including extensive social research. There is no doubt that the theme of migration and its significance under Criterion A is important. Preston Market as a place expressing the role of post-war migration may also be indicated under Criterion C (potential to yield further information). It is considered that additional material yielded on the theme of post-war migration is likely to be obtained not through further examination of the physical place, but through documentary evidence, further social research and oral history. It is therefore recommended that Criterion A is the most appropriate criterion for assessment.

Preston Market has been instrumental in theme (4.) *Developing Darebin’s economies – 4.6 retailing, hospitality and entertainment* in the post-war period, and specifically represents a shift in shopping patterns and practices of the 1950s and 60s to a traditional form in contrast to the enclosed shopping centre model imported from North America. It also represents the municipality’s transition from early noxious industries in the nineteenth-century, with the old Braithwaite tannery being the original use of the site, to having a thriving commercial, civic and community precinct at the heart of Preston. The post-war boom in Darebin was supported by and supported the development of the Preston Market (5. *Building suburban development - 5.3 Developing the suburban ideal*).

Architectural and technological comparisons

The Preston Market demonstrates the first use of space frame technology in Victoria, and coupled with its strong industrial aesthetic, is not directly comparable to other markets types of the inter- and post-war era. The original cruciform layout of Preston Market is comparable to that of Bell Street Mall. Built in 1956-57, the Mall retains its original design intent, a layout of shops either side of a pedestrian street, a design objective not dissimilar to that of Preston Market.

The space frame technology and its application at the Preston Market has not been examined in detail. This is an area for further research, primarily through comparative analysis of this engineering technology and its application more broadly.

2.3 Relative significance

Based on the data and analysis of significance presented above, Preston Market satisfies the following criterion at the local level to the City of Darebin and therefore meets the local threshold for historical, aesthetic, creative and technical, and social significance.

Table 2. Criteria for which Preston Market reaches the threshold for local significance

| Criteria | Meets threshold? |
|--|------------------|
| Criterion A: Importance to the course, or pattern, of Victoria's cultural history. | Yes |
| Criterion B: Possession of uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of Victoria's cultural history. | No |
| Criterion C: Potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of Victoria's cultural history. | No |
| Criterion D: Importance in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of cultural places and objects. | Yes |
| Criterion E: Importance in exhibiting particular aesthetic characteristics. | Yes |
| Criterion F: Importance in demonstrating a high degree of creative or technical achievement at a particular period. | Yes |
| Criterion G: Strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group for social, cultural or spiritual reasons. This includes the significance of a place to Indigenous peoples as part of their continuing and developing cultural traditions. | Yes |
| Criterion H: Special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in Victoria's history. | No |

2.4 Statement of significance

What is significant

The Preston Market complex, comprising the original footprint of the market buildings, the built form, structural elements particularly the space frame, the internal pedestrian 'streets' and interior elements is of local significance. Excluded from the area of significance are the car parking areas and the former Market Hall. The specific attributes and their relative significance is indicated in the section below.

How is it significant

Preston Market is of local historical, representative, aesthetic, creative and technical and social significance to the City of Darebin.

Why is it significant

Preston Market is historically significance as the first post-war market to be created in Melbourne designed to support a growing local population and to offer the diversity of culturally relevant foods and social experiences desired by a post-war migrant community. (Criterion A)

Preston Market is historically significant for its ability to demonstrate key historical phases in the development of Preston, particularly development of a civic, commercial and community hub (at a precinct level) following the closure of the local tanning business Broadhurst's which made extensive areas of land available for new uses and activities. (Criterion A)

Preston Market is historically significant for its ability to demonstrate the social and cultural changes that resulted from post-war migration in terms of food and cuisine, and demonstrates a remarkable continuity in its adaptability to an ongoing process of migrant-related social change. (Criterion A)

Preston Market demonstrates, at the local level, the influence of post-war migration on the cultural and social life of Victorian communities in the latter half of the twentieth century. The market is historically significant for its ability to demonstrate cultural adaptability, diversity and inclusion, characteristics that are markers of local identity in the City of Darebin. (Criterion A) This aspect of historical significance is closely related to social significance.

Preston Market is significant as a representative example of a post-war market form, combining the traditional elements of stalls within a pedestrian space, while also providing the car parking sought in the post-war years as car ownership expanded. The key characteristics include the market-style retailing (stalls, individual owners), the number and diversity of traders offering specific types of products (rather than a single retailer per product), pedestrian spaces, gathering and mingling spaces, open-air (although with shelter added subsequently), conceptually a 'public space' (noting that in fact it is privately owned but reads as a public place), and permeability in terms of access to and through the market area. (Criterion D)

Preston Market is of aesthetic significance based the design concept and its realisation. It reflects a contemporary industrial aesthetic through the rhythm of the structural forms and repeated web-like structure of the space frame steel trusses. (Criterion E)

Preston Market is of creative and technical significance for its adoption of new architectural concepts that espoused flexibility and adaptability in buildings as a response to rapid social change experienced in the post-war period. (Criterion F)

Preston Market has social significance for its strong and special associations with the Preston and wider communities who shop at the market, and with stallholders, many of whom have been a part of the market for many years, and sometimes are second generation traders. (Criterion G)

Preston Market has social significance to the Preston community and wider communities as important social and cultural landmark within the inner northern suburbs. It signifies the particular history of the post-war period and in serving as a focus for social exchange is intimately connected to the daily life of Preston. (Criterion G)

Preston Market has social significance as a place that sustains important community ideas about cultural diversity and inclusiveness. These form a significant element in community identity across the City of Darebin and are actively celebrated. (Criterion G)

Preston Market is of social significance as a place that creates and sustains opportunities for cultural practices and traditions associated with food and cuisine to continue. The market symbolically connects people to their own cultural pasts and those of the wider community. (Criterion G)

Preston Market is of social significance as a place where strong and special attachments have been created and continue, and that go beyond the simple utility of the market as a shopping venue. These attachments are linked to the place, the function and interpersonal relationships. (Criterion G)

Attributes

This section provides a summary of the tangible and intangible attributes of Preston Market, based on the analysis of significance presented above. There is a strong relationship between the physical or tangible form of the market and its intangible attributes. Intangible attributes

are those that relate to cultural practices, knowledge, traditions, performance, beliefs and world views etc.

Attributes are what 'hold' or embody or express a particular aspect of significance.

- The market layout, with two main axes arranged in a cruciform plan and functioning as pedestrian streets:
 - crossing points that create spaces for people to encounter one another, helping sustain social engagement and community
 - the openness of the edges of the market make it permeable and help create the sense of a 'community' or 'public' space
 - the breadth of the internal pedestrian 'streets' creates space for people to mingle, sit, talk and socialise
 - the open-air nature of the spaces (while also offering shelter).
- The market-style of retailing:
 - The individual stalls operated as small businesses support the cultural diversity of the market
 - Cultural diversity creates a sense of safety, inclusiveness.
- The built form of the market, and particularly the repetitive structure facilitated by the space frame elements of the roof structure and the supporting columns.
- The market buildings as whole, noting the level of intactness:

Table 3. Intactness of Preston Market buildings

| | |
|---------------------------------------|--|
| Highly intact: | Sheds 3 and 4 – Fruit & Vegetable retailers - structural elements with businesses opening to pedestrian walk and operating with roller doors Eastern end of Shed 1 - structural elements and some shopfronts Pedestrian walkways in a cruciform layout |
| Moderately intact: | Sheds 6 and 7 – structural elements and glass shopfronts opening to the pedestrian walkway. Shed 7 - shopfronts now screened from pedestrian walkway. |
| Somewhat intact | Shed 5 - structural elements remain but alterations to shopfronts and extension of building footprint. |
| Highly altered or later construction: | Brick shops at west and north ends of Shed 1 All of Shed 2 The Market Hall (Cramer Street) The walkway canopies |

- The cultural diversity of the market that supports both continuity and sharing of cultural practices and traditions, particularly those relating to food and cuisine.
- The diversity and continuity of businesses sustains interpersonal relationships that are a valued part of the market experience.

Summary

The layout, breadth and permeability of the 'pedestrian streets' are highly valued attributes of the market. These spaces promote activity and interaction, particularly where shopfronts still open to these spaces.

The cruciform layout of the market and the repetitive structural elements of the columns and space frame roof have value.

The diverse businesses of the market provide cultural diversity through relationships, sharing of traditions and a sense of social inclusiveness and safety.

3 KEY FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

3.1 Significance of Preston Market

Local significance

A key finding of this heritage study is that Preston Market has local heritage significance to the City of Darebin. It has been assessed in accordance with the requirements of the *Planning Practice Note 1: Applying the Heritage Overlay* (DELWP 2015) using the recognised heritage criteria, and a comparative analysis has been undertaken.

Darebin Planning Scheme

Local government authorities have a responsibility to protect and manage places that meet the threshold of local significance, through the application of the Heritage Overlay. Under the Heritage Policy in the Darebin Planning Scheme there is a responsibility to:

...conserve and enhance heritage places of natural or cultural significance.

...conserve and enhance those elements which contribute to the significance of heritage places.

...ensure that development does not adversely affect the significance of heritage places.

...conserve specifically identified heritage places by allowing a use that would otherwise be prohibited if this will demonstrably assist with the conservation of the significance of the heritage place.¹⁵

The *Planning Practice Note 1: Applying the Heritage Overlay* (DELWP 2015) recognises that 'planning is about managing the environment and changes to it' requiring that planning controls – including the Heritage Overlay – be applied to 'something' that can be managed. Generally this guidance is considered to mean that only tangible attributes of the place can be managed – for example, land use, demolition, built forms etc.

Preston Market has both tangible and intangible attributes that contribute to its identified significance (see Section 5.4). The Heritage Overlay can be applied to provide a sound basis for conservation of the identified built form, fabric and layout elements of the Preston Market.

It is recommended that: The City of Darebin seek to protect Preston Market through the application of the Heritage Overlay in the Darebin Planning Scheme.

The heritage place is defined spatially by an extent map (Figure 52) and identification of the elements assessed as significant and not significant (Table 4).

A draft Heritage Schedule below (Table 5) indicates the relevant controls.

¹⁵ Darebin Planning Scheme, Clause 43.01, Heritage Policy, Planning Schemes online, accessed 26 November 2017.

Preston Market - Significance of Elements



- Area recommended for curtilage (8.75m around market boundary)
- Built fabric - Significant
- Walkways - Significant
- Built fabric - Not Significant



Figure 1. Aerial image of market with areas of relative significance marked. The yellow line represents an 8.75m curtilage around the market buildings. (Source Aerial Photo: Near Maps 2017)

Table 4: Significant elements

| Relative significance | Integrity | Attributes |
|-----------------------|---------------------------------------|--|
| Significant | Highly intact: | Sheds 3 and 4 –footprint, structural elements and shops Eastern end of Shed 1 - structural elements and some shops Pedestrian walkways in a cruciform layout |
| Significant | Moderately intact: | Sheds 6 and 7 – footprint, structural elements and shops Shed 7 – footprint and structural elements |
| Significant | Somewhat intact | Shed 5 footprint and structural elements |
| Not significant | Highly altered or later construction: | Brick shops at west and north ends of Shed 1 All of Shed 2 Market Hall (Cramer Street) Walkway canopies |

Table 5: Recommended controls

| PS Ref No. | Heritage Place | External Paint Controls Apply? | Internal Alteration Controls Apply? | Tree Controls Apply? | Outbuildings or Fences which are Not Exempt under Cl.43.01-3? | Included on the Victorian Heritage Register under the Heritage Act 1995? | Prohibited uses may be permitted? | Name of Incorporated Plan under Cl.43.01-2 | Aboriginal heritage place? |
|------------|--|--------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|---|--|-----------------------------------|--|----------------------------|
| HOXX | Preston Market, cnr. Mary and Cramer Streets Preston | No | Yes | No | No | No | No | Preston Market Incorporated Plan [date] | No |

Preston Market Incorporated Plan

The 2007 Preston Market Incorporated Plan is a flexible document that can guide the future use and development of Preston Market. It is a useful way of providing certainty around development and guiding permit conditions and/or exemptions, including permits that relate to heritage. The Incorporated Plan offers an opportunity to recognise significant intangible attributes of Preston Market.

Following the determination of the VCAT Hearing¹⁶ by the Tribunal some relevant material from this decision may be able to be used in the Incorporated Plan.

By contrast, if one walks into the centre of the whole site where the market is located, it is this area that is so lively, distinctive, very bustling and involving an offering of fresh fruits/meats/fish/ etc that is rare in the northern suburbs. It is full of character. It was this central area that mainly featured in the video shown to us and which was being highlighted. The critical role of this central area is reinforced by the statement by Council in the last quoted paragraph above that “The fresh food market is the Market”.¹⁷

¹⁶ Preston Market Developments v Darebin City Council [2017] VCAT 1689

¹⁷ Ibid, Clause 117

Some revisions to the Preston Market Incorporated Plan¹⁸ may assist in protecting these attributes of the market and managing change through the application of good urban design and conservation principles.¹⁹

It is recommended that: the following matters relevant to the Incorporated Plan are addressed by the City of Darebin in consultation with Market management and property owners. These are designed to support the statement of significance and help provide good heritage management; further they address both tangible and intangible attributes of the Market through:

- achieving high quality pedestrian amenity through consideration of building scale, microclimate issues and access.
- integration of the public realm with the Market
- limiting large scale development within specified distances of the Market footprint.

The above objectives are consistent with the Market's social value and the importance of retaining certain attributes including:

- the wide cruciform pedestrian streets that offer a stage for activities or encounters
- crossing places that sustain social engagement
- open edges that promote public access
- natural light and a sense of being open to the outside ('open air market').

A set of guidelines that sit underneath the Incorporated Plan could assist in managing different attribute of built form and spaces, and their tolerance for change.

Guidelines could be developed to cover the following (for example):

- maintenance, conservation and repair
- demolition, alterations and additions
- new development
- signage
- interpretation.

Developing the guidelines would be undertaken as a collaborative process with Market management, property owners and the City of Darebin.

The City of Darebin may also seek to identify ways that the other intangible attributes of the market can be supported. For example, cultural diversity and social inclusion are valued attributes that would be difficult to address through the usual planning tools, but may be able to be addressed as desired objectives and any proposed changes assessed against these objectives.

3.2 Respecting connections and meanings

Preston Market is more than a built form. It is a place alive with community connections that are expressed through activities, inter-personal engagements and relationships. Cultural practices and traditions associated with migration are expressed, continued and adapted

¹⁸ Preston Market Incorporated Plan March 2007

¹⁹ 'Final combined comments 18/6/2017 Preston Market Proposed changes. Peter Mondy – Principal Strategic Planner, Darebin Council (unpublished, Darebin Council Internal Document objective reference A4094850) June 2017.

through retail exchange and knowledge sharing. These intangible attributes arise from community connections as document in Section 4 and assessed in relation to Criterion G social significance in Section 5. This is an important finding of this heritage study.

In relation to 'Places of significance for historical or social reasons' The *Planning Practice Note 1: Applying the Heritage Overlay* (DELWP 2015) says:

Planning is about managing the environment and changes to it. An appropriate test for a potential heritage place to pass in order to apply the Heritage Overlay is that it has 'something' to be managed. This 'something' is usually tangible but it may, for example, be an absence of built form or the presence of some other special characteristic. If such things are present, there will be something to manage and the Heritage Overlay may be applied.

If not, a commemorative plaque is an appropriate way of signifying the importance of the place to the local community.

Planning tools are generally not well suited to the task of retaining intangible attributes, and different approaches are needed, some of which may be able to be addressed in the Incorporated Plan and/or guidelines, as proposed above. Further, the VCAT determination on how social heritage can best be managed needs to be considered.

The Burra Charter recognises that the cultural significance of a place may be embodied in use, associations and meanings as well as in the physical fabric, setting, records, related places and objects (Australia ICOMOS 2013: Article 1.2). Guidance on the principles intangible attributes, associations or connections and meanings is offered in the following Burra Charter articles:

Article 3.1 Conservation is based on a respect for the existing *fabric, use, associations and meanings*. It requires a cautious approach of changing as much as necessary but as little as possible.

Article 12. Participation

Conservation, interpretation and management of a place should provide for the participation of people for whom the place has significant associations and meanings, or who have social, spiritual or other cultural responsibilities for the place

Article 24. Retaining associations and meanings

24.1 Significant associations between people and a place should be respected, retained and not obscured. Opportunities for the interpretation, commemoration and celebration of these associations should be investigated and implemented.

24.2 Significant meanings, including spiritual values, of a place should be respected. Opportunities for the continuation or revival of these meanings should be investigated and implemented.

26.3 Groups and individuals with associations with the place as well as those involved in its management should be provided with opportunities to contribute to and participate in identifying and understanding the cultural significance of the place. Where appropriate they should also have opportunities to participate in its conservation and management.

27.2 Existing fabric, use, associations and meanings should be adequately recorded before and after any changes are made to the place.

In relation to Preston Market, it is suggested that the City of Darebin, Market management and the property owners could establish a set of objectives or principles in the Incorporated Plan or in another form to:

- recognise and express respect for community connections (associations) and meanings that are evident in activities, uses and cultural practice at the market
- appreciate the important social role of the market in the life of the local and market communities and bring this into in future planning and design

-
- establish a suitable process for community engagement when change is proposed, and
 - establish a process for heritage impact assessment in relation to changes that might impact community connections (associations) and meanings
 - make this heritage study publicly available and prepare archival standard photography record.

The documentation in this heritage study provides a testament to the social history, community connections and meanings associated with Preston Market and should therefore become a public document. A further and important step would be the preparation of an archival standard photography record.

There are also opportunities for these parties – separately or together - to support the retention of connections and meanings through interpretation. This is addressed below.

3.3 Interpretation: sharing the stories and significance of Preston Market

Interpretation is part of the toolkit of conservation processes. Interpretation can be used in many ways, through assisting in understanding significance or to highlight significant attributes, particularly those that are intangible.

It is recommended that interpretation be used to help share the stories of Preston Market. The first step would be to prepare a concise interpretation strategy that considers audience/s, media and content and provides an action plan for implementation.

This heritage study, along with the *Market Crossings* project (Stead 2010), has revealed some of the themes and stories that could be a focus for interpretation. Extensive interview material is also available in the preliminary assessment by Context Pty Ltd in 2011. There are also opportunities to engage with the market communities through community-based art, oral history and photography so that people can tell their own stories in their own ways.

It is recommended that the City of Darebin initiates an interpretation strategy project, in consultation with Market management and the property owners.

Specifically, it is recommended that the City of Darebin supports:

- publication of a brief social history of the Preston Market in an accessible format (hard copy, e-book)
- a community-based activity or activities to document community perceptions of the market and market life/culture: this could be through an arts, history or culture-focused project
- on-site interpretation of the stories of the Preston Market (via story-boards, QR codes or a place-based app)
- links the stories of the market to the wider stories of the immediate locality.

3.4 Further research into potential State significance

There are indicators for State significance for Preston Market for its expression of post-war migrant history and its early use of space frame engineering technology. Research into space frame use would be likely to involve interviews with the designers and a state-wide comparative analysis of places using this technology.

Research into post-war migration history would look more broadly at places expressing this theme state-wide and potentially involve further social research. Preston Market, selected as a case study for *Victoria's Post 1940s Migration Heritage* demonstrates several themes in relation to migrant heritage. Working in small business, shopping for and cooking specialty foods, as well as the celebration of food as culture is strong at Preston Market. A broad set of comparisons with other markets and places that have strong migrant heritage would be required to establish

whether Preston Market demonstrated this better than most other places with substantially the same association.

The results of these two pieces of work would inform whether a recommendation to the Victorian Heritage Register is warranted under Criterion A (historical value) or Criterion F (technological value).

REFERENCES

Reports

Context Pty Ltd, 'Bell Street Mall Heritage Assessment & Guidelines', for Banyule City Council, 2010

Context Pty Ltd, *City of Darebin Heritage Study Vol.1: Thematic Environmental History*, prepared for City of Darebin, 2007.

Context Pty Ltd, *Victoria's Post-1940s Migration Heritage – Darebin Pilot Project: Volume 3A: Pilot Project*, prepared for the City of Darebin, 2011.

Context Pty Ltd, 'Queen Victoria Market National Heritage List Assessment', prepared for Queen Victoria Market Pty Ltd, 2015.

City of Darebin, Preston Market Incorporated Plan, March 2007

Department of Environment, Land, Water and Planning, *Planning Practice Note 1: Applying the Heritage Overlay*, 2015

Final combined comments 18/6/2017 Preston Market Proposed changes. Peter Mondy – Principal Strategic Planner, Darebin Council (unpublished, Darebin Council Internal Document objective reference A4094850) June 2017

Hermes record, Preston City Oval, 27068, City of Darebin, accessed 1 November 2017

Hermes record, Preston Town Hall, 76929, City of Darebin, accessed 1 November 2017

Hermes record, Shops (former), 27314, City of Darebin, accessed 1 November 2017

Hermes record, West Preston Progress Hall, 26608, City of Darebin, accessed 1 November 2017

Preston Market Incorporated Plan March 2007

Heritage Alliance (2008), 'Survey of post war built heritage in Victoria, Stage 1, Volume 1', prepared for Heritage Victoria

Published works

Australia ICOMOS Burra Charter, 2013; Heritage Council of Victoria 2014, *The Victorian Heritage Register Criteria and Threshold Guidelines: Assessing the cultural heritage significance of places and objects for possible state heritage listing*

Heritage Council of Victoria, 2009. *Victoria's Framework of Historical Themes*. State of Victoria.

'Intangible Cultural Heritage and Place', The Australia ICOMOS National Scientific Committee on Intangible Cultural Heritage, August 2017

Stead, Victoria, *Market Crossings. Plotting a course through the Preston Market, Melbourne*, Carlton: Breakdown Press, 2010.

Unpublished works

Johnston Chris (Context Pty Ltd), Social Values Assessment in Regional Forest Agreements National Estate studies of social value across Australia, for Australian Heritage Commission, n.d.

Online resources

'Celebrating 50 years of history at Caribbean Gardens and Market!', Caribbean Gardens website, 2016, <<http://caribbeangardens.com.au/>>, accessed 1 November 2017

Chancellor Jonathan, 'Payneswicke, the heritage Elsternwick Trophy home sold', Property Observer website, 9 September 2014, <<http://www.propertyobserver.com.au/forward->

planning/advice-and-hot-topics/title-tattle/35499-payneswicke-the-heritage-elsternwick-trophy-home-sold.html> accessed 1 November 2017

'Dawn of the dead mall: will we follow the US and dump the shopping centre?', The Conversation, <<http://theconversation.com/dawn-of-the-dead-mall-will-we-follow-the-us-and-dump-the-shopping-centre-3507>> accessed 20 November 2017

Laurie Richards Studio, 'Preston Market with People Located in a Courtyard Surrounded by Shops', negative, 1970, Laurie Richards Collection, Museum Victoria), <<https://collections.museumvictoria.com.au/items/800420>>, accessed 28 July 2017.

'Market History', Dandenong Market Website, 2015, <<http://dandenongmarket.com.au/about/history>>, accessed 1 November 2017

Preston Market Developments v Darebin City Council [2017] VCAT 1689

APPENDIX 1: CRITERIA FOR ASSESSING CULTURAL SIGNIFICANCE

The following criteria – referred to as the HERCON criteria – have been adopted by the Heritage Council of Victoria. Their application is detailed in *The Victorian Heritage Register Criteria and Threshold Guidelines: Assessing the cultural heritage significance of places and objects for possible state heritage listing* (updated 2014).

The criteria can be applied to assess state significance by reference to Victoria, or to a local area by reference to that locality.

The thematic frameworks in Section 2.5 and Appendix 2 also form part of the process of assessing significance using the criteria.

Criterion A: Importance to the course, or pattern, of Victoria’s cultural history.

Criterion B: Possession of uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of Victoria’s cultural history.

Criterion C: Potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of Victoria’s cultural history.

Criterion D: Importance in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of cultural places and objects.

Criterion E: Importance in exhibiting particular aesthetic characteristics.

Criterion F: Importance in demonstrating a high degree of creative or technical achievement at a particular period.

Criterion G: Strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group for social, cultural or spiritual reasons. This includes the significance of a place to Indigenous peoples as part of their continuing and developing cultural traditions.

Criterion H: Special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in Victoria’s history.

APPENDIX 2: INDICATORS OF SOCIAL VALUE

The framework of social value indicators is detailed below.

1 Important to a community as a landmark, marker or signature

Specific significance indicators:

- Landmarks
- Signature places and icons - places used to symbolically represent a locality or community
- Locational markers - places that mark where you are in a landscape/locality and places that figure as landmarks in daily life
- Understanding history and environment ("our place in the world") - special and unusual features that help explain the local environment in all its diversity

Likely place characteristics:

Named landscape or built features

Entry or centre points of a locality

Place used as community signature

2 Important as a reference point in a community's identity or sense of itself

Specific significance indicators

- Strong symbolic qualities which define a community
- Spiritual or traditional connection between past and present
- Represents (embodies) important collective (community) meaning/s
- Association with events having a profound effect on a community
- Symbolically represents the past in the present (connects the past and the present)
- Represents attitudes, beliefs, behaviours fundamental to community identity

Likely place characteristics

Mythological sites

Places where continuing tradition/ceremony is practiced or where tradition is passed on

Places where the continuity/survival of a community is celebrated

Places where a community's identity has been forged such as disaster sites, foundation places, seminal events in a community's life

3 Strong or special community attachment developed from use and/or association

Specific significance indicators

- Essential community function leading to special attachment
- Longevity of use or association including continuity to the present

Likely place characteristics:

Places providing essential community functions such as schools, halls, churches

Community meeting places (of all types)

Places defended at times of threat (to the place) for reasons of attachment not just function

Places with a long tradition and continuity of community use or access.

APPENDIX 2: ASSESSMENT OF SOCIAL SIGNIFICANCE

METHODOLOGY

Criterion G is seen as a contemporary value, held by people today. Indicators of social value developed and applied nationally offer valuable guidance in analysing data in relation to the criterion. The three indicators of social significance used here are:

1. Importance to a community as a landmark, marker or signature
2. Importance as a reference point in a community's identity or sense of itself
3. Strong or special community attachment developed from use and/or association.²⁰

These three indicators are elaborated below.

The criterion and the threshold definitions specified in Heritage Council of Victoria's (HCV) *Victorian Heritage Register Criteria and Threshold Guidelines* (2014) have also been considered. This guidance addresses the HERCON criteria for a state-level threshold, but there is no specific guidance at the local level for social significance. Using the HCV's guidance as a basis, this report notes:

- community or cultural group should be a 'sizable group of persons who share a common or long-standing interest or identity'; but while it is a shared value, it does not need to be universally held by everyone in a group
- 'strong or special' association may be evidenced by the regular or long-term use of/engagement with the place and/or enduring ceremonial, ritual, commemorative, spiritual or celebratory use of the place.

Thresholds are used to determine the level of cultural heritage significance (i.e. state or local) the place may hold under each criterion, and what mechanisms can therefore be used to protect and manage it. The HCV guidance establishes the State threshold by requiring that the strong or special association is:

- a particularly strong example of the association between the place/object and the community or cultural group, and because it has
- a relationship to importance historical events in Victoria and/or
- for its ability to interpret experiences to the broader Victorian community.

At the local level, 'Victoria' and 'Victorian' can be replaced with 'local', in this case the Preston community or other specific communities. The Practice Note *Intangible Cultural Heritage and Place*²¹ states that:

'Local Significance' includes those places that are important to a particular community or locality.

Often inclusion and exclusion factors are also considered in relation to social value. Inclusion factors may be:

- that the community attachment to the place is demonstrable, enduring (20 years is a guide), continuing and broadly based
- that the association is out of the ordinary, not everyday

²⁰ These indicators are drawn from a social values assessment method developed for the Australian Heritage Commission by Chris Johnston (Context Pty Ltd) and used in the Regional Forest Agreements National Estate studies of social value across Australia.

²¹ 'Intangible Cultural Heritage and Place', The Australia ICOMOS National Scientific Committee on Intangible Cultural Heritage, August 2017

-
- that there has been high community regard for an extended period.

Typical exclusions include, for example:

- where the place is only important to the community for amenity reasons
- where retention is preferred over a proposed alternative
- where the association is short-term, provoked by a threat and where the longevity of that association was not sustained
- where the group is unable to demonstrate an important cultural association with the place
- demonstrated only through petition, a form letter or similar
- demonstrated only through petition, a form letter or similar
- held only by a small percentage of the community or cultural group.